Ronald Ryan Attorney for Debtors 1413 E Hedrick Drive Tucson, Arizona 85719 (520)298-3333 phone (520)743-1020 fax ronryanlaw@cox.net AZ Bar #018140 Pima Cty #65325

# UNITED STATES BANKRUPTCY COURT DISTRICT OF ARIZONA, TUCSON DIVISION

In re:

Case No. 09-33553-TUC-EWH

CONNELLY, DAVID AND CONNELLY, ELIZABETH Objector/Debtor

OBJECTION TO PROOF OF CLAIM AUTOMOBILE - 2008 FORD EXPEDITION

VS.

Chapter 13

FORD MOTOR CREDIT COMPANY, LLC, Claimant

PERTAINING TO CLAIM # 13 Filed 05/16/11 IN THE COURT'S CLAIM'S REGISTRY

COMES NOW, DAVID CONNELLY ELIZABETH CONNELLY Objector and Debtor, and files this Objection to Proof of Claim, pursuant to 11 USC § 502(b)(1), Bankruptcy Rule 3007(a), Local Bankruptcy Rule 3007-1 and 2084-9(b), filed 05/16/11, at Claim # 13 in the Court's Claims Registry, by FORD MOTOR CREDIT COMPANY, LLC, Claimant, and presents unto the Court as follows:

PLEASE BE ADVISED THAT, PURSUANT TO LOCAL BKY RULE 3007-1, YOU HAVE FOURTEEN (14) DAYS FROM THE DATE HEREOF TO OBJECT AND/OR TO REQUEST A HEARING ON THIS MOTION. IF YOU DO NOT DO SO, THIS MOTION MAY BE DEEMED UNOPPOSED AND AN ORDER MAY BE ENTERED GRANTING THE RELIEF REQUESTED. ANY SUCH OBJECTION OR REQUEST FOR HEARING SHOULD BE SERVED UPON THE UNDERSIGNED COUNSEL.

1. This chapter 13 case was commenced by the filing of a petition on

12/29/2009.

2. FORD MOTOR CREDIT COMPANY, LLC, Claimant is a corporation doing business in Arizona, whose Statutory Agent is CT CORPORATION SYSTEM 2394 E CAMELBACK RD PHOENIX, AZ 85016, according to official records filed with the Arizona Secretary of State.

3. On May 16, 2011, Claimant filed its Proof of Claim, listed in the Court's Claims Registry as Claim # Claim 13, secured by a lien in Debtor's 2008 FORD EXPEDITION, in the secured amount of \$25,517.84. The deadline for filing a Proof of Claim was May 4, 2010. Claimant never objected to Debtor's Plan nor its treatment in the Plan. The Claim is attached.

# **PLAN TERMS**

4. On 1/18/2010, Debtors filed their original plan, which provided that said creditor would be paid \$18,500.00 with interest at 4.0 % through the Chapter 13 Plan. Debtor hereby references said Plan and the other documents cited herein that are filed with the Court both in the main Court's Docket and in the Court's Claim's Registry, as if as if the contents were included herein. The deadline to object to the Plan was February 17, 2010.

# MEMORANDUM FAILURE TO OBJECT

Claimant did not timely, or otherwise, object to the Plan. The failure to timely object to the original plan, constituted deemed "acceptance," as that term is used in 11 USC § 1325(a)(5)(A), "The holder of said claim has accepted the plan." Both Local Bankruptcy Rule 2084-9(b) and the Notice of Date to File Objection to Chapter 13 Plan served by the Clerk of the Court along with Debtor's Plan, provide:

The failure of a party in interest timely to file an objection to confirmation of a plan or the granting of a motion for a moratorium **shall constitute acceptance of the plan**...

The above rule along with the deadline to object are boldly printed on the first page of the Official Form, "Notice of Date to File Objection to Chapter 13 Plan," that is served as evidenced by sworn and signed declaration, upon all creditors contained in the included service list, by the Clerk of the Bankruptcy Court, along with the Chapter 13 Plan. See Notice of Date to File Objection to Chapter 13 Plan at Doc 18 Filed 01/19/10 Entered 01/22/10.. Claimant did not timely, or otherwise, object to Debtor's Plan.

### MEMORANDUM LATE FILED CLAIM

A Court is without authority to allow a late filed proof of claim unless it falls within one of the five exceptions specifically enumerated by Rule 3002(c). In re Gardenhire, 209 F.3d 1145 (9th Cir.2000). Matter of Greenig, 152 F.3d 631 (7th Cir.1998); In re Aboody, 22,3 B.R. 36 (1st Cir. BAP 1998); In re Kelley, 259 B.R. 580, 583-4 (Bankr. E.D. Tex., 2001); In re Nwonwu, 362 B.R. 705 (Bankr. E.D.Va., 2007); In re McQueen, 22,8 B.R. 408 (Bankr. M.D.Tenn.1998). This Rule coupled with FRCP 9006(b)(3) proscribes the Court's usual discretion to enlarge a time period established under the Bankruptcy Rules for taking a particular action upon a showing of "excusable neglect," and so there is no discretion or other excuse permitted. See, e.g., Pioneer Investment Services Co. v. Brunswick Associates, 507 U.S. 380, 113 S.Ct. 1489, 123 L.Ed.2d 74 (1993); In re Gardenhire; In re 50-Off Stores, Inc., 220 B.R. 897, 901 (Bankr.W.D.Tex.1998); In re Kelley, supra at fn 6; 9 Collier on Bankruptcy, ¶ 3002.03[1]; (15th ed. rev.2006) (footnotes omitted); In re Nwonwu, 362 B.R. 705, 707-8 (Bankr. E.D.Va., 2007); In re Johnson, 84 B.R. 492, 494 (Bankr.N.D.Ohio 1988); Matter of Greenig, 152 F.3d 631, 634-35 (7th Cir.1998). This is so even if there was an absence of proper notice of the bar date for filing proofs of claim; In re Duarte, 146 B.R. 958 (Bankr.W.D.Tex.1992); In re Kelley, supra; In re Nwonwu, supra; In re Franklin, Case 09-11784 (Bky MD La March 4, 2011). The time limits for filing a claim are as strict as a statute of limitations. In re Johnson, 84 B.R. 492 (Bankr.N.D.Ohio 1988); Zimmerman, 156 B.R. at 199.

There is no distinction between secured and unsecured claims as to the above rules. Above cited cases; Hamlett v. Amsouth Bank (In re Hamlett), 322 F.3d 342 (4th Cir. 2003); In re Nwonwu, supra; In re Kelley, supra; In re Dennis, 230 B.R. 244, 246 (Bankr. D.N.J.1999); In re Schaffer, supra at 399.

Therefore, the only legitimate outcome is that for both secured and unsecured claims to be allowed, they must be filed under Section 501. To reach any other result would be absurd. In re Canganelli, 13,2 B.R. 369 (Bankr. N.D.Ind.1991) (citing Hawaii v. Mankichi, 190 U.S. 197, 213, 23 S.Ct. 787, 789, 47 L.Ed. 1016 (1903) for the proposition that "since all statutory interpretation cases are seeking to find a way to interpret a statute sensibly, and all laws should receive a sensible construction, general terms should be limited in their application so as to not lead to injustice, oppression or an absurd result.").

In re Schaffer, 173 B.R. 393, 395 (Bankr. N.D. III., 1994). Secured creditors that did not file a timely claim must accept the treatment that they receive under the plan, even if the treatment they receive is that they receive no distribution. In re Dennis, supra; In re Kelley, supra at 584-5, fn 9; In re Nwonwu, supra at 710; In re Alderman, 150 B.R. 246 (Bankr.D.Mont.1993); see also In re Wells, 125 B.R. 297 (Bankr.D.Colo.1991); In re Thomas, 91 B.R. 117 n. 9 (Bankr.N.D.Ala.1988) aff'd 883 F.2d 991 (11th Cir.1989); In re Van Hierden, 87 B.R. 563 (Bankr.E.D.Wis.1988); In re Rogers, 57 B.R. 170 (Bankr. E.D.Tenn.1986); In re Linkous, 14,1 B.R. 890 (Bankr. W.D.Va.1992) aff'd 990 F.2d 160

(4th Cir. 1993); In re King, 165 B.R. 296 (Bankr.M.D.Fla.1994); In re Schaffer, supra at 396.

The Debtors' confirmed plan contemplates payment of Bank One's claim. However, to the extent the claim exceeds the value of the collateral, it is to be treated as unsecured and is to be paid at 50% along with the other unsecured claims. This much is certain, and must be kept in mind throughout this Opinion: To the extent Bank One has an unsecured claim, the late filing is fatal. On April 22, 1994, this Court entered an order disallowing Bank One's claim in its entirety due to the late filing.

In re Schaffer, 173 B.R. 393 (Bankr. N.D. III., 1994).

In re Lindgren, Case No. 90-B-04639 CEM. The motion of GMAC to have the plan act as an informal proof of claim is denied, the motion of GMAC to file an amended claim which increases the amount of the secured claim of GMAC beyond that specified in the plan is denied, and the secured claim of GMAC shall be paid in the manner and amount specified in the plan.

In re Babbin, 164 B.R. 157, 164 (Bankr.Colo., 1994).

- 5. Debtor requests that this Court sustain Debtors' Objection to Claimant's Claim to the extent the same is contrary to Debtor's Plan. Accordingly, Debtor requests that the Court find that the amount to be paid Claimant as its secured claim shall be \$18,500.00 with 4.0 % interest inside Debtor's Plan, with the remainder of its claim being unsecured. The Prime Rate is 3.25%.
- 6. Even if the Claim had been filed timely and an objection had been filed, and even if the 910 rule applied, or commonly known as the hanging paragraph, exceptions include a vehicle not purchased primary for personal use, but when purchased with the intent to use in business. Another exception is negative equity.
- 7. The Kelley Blue Book is no longer a credible source for finding true fair market values for vehicles. There is at present almost no market for used cars, but the values in the book remain high. Secondly, even Kelley says the listed prices are dealer

asking prices, not actual retail sales prices. Also, the Objection states a value higher even than the unreliable Kelley Blue Book for the Dakota attached to the Objection to Plan. The Kelley says in the book, these are "suggested retail values." The book states:

SUGGESTED RETAIL VALUES represent Kelley Blue Book's estimated dealer asking price. The actual selling price may vary substantially.

(Italics added.)

8. The Edmunds.com and Edmunds publications provide values based on research of actual retail sales.

WHEREFORE, PREMISES CONSIDERED, Plaintiffs request that this Court sustain Debtor's Objection and that he/she have such other and further relief as is appropriate.

Respectfully submitted, /S/ Ronald Ryan Ronald Ryan, Attorney for Debtor

# CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I certify that a true copy of the forgoing was emailed to Chapter 13 Trustee, Dianne C. Kerns, and Debtor, on November 15, 2011, and mailed to the following:

/s/ Ronald Ryan Ronald Ryan

CT CORPORATION SYSTEM
2394 E CAMELBACK RD
PHOENIX, AZ 85016
FOR FORD MOTOR CREDIT COMPANY LLC

/s/ Ronald Ryan Ronald Ryan

B 10 (Official Form 10) (04/10) NBSC 11/15/10 **UNITED STATES BANKRUPTCY COURT** - TUCSON District of ARIZONA PROOF OF CLAIM Name of Debtor: David A Connelly Case Number: 09-33553 Ch13 NOTE: This form should not be used to make a claim for an administrative expense arising after the commencement of the case. A request of payment of an administrative expense may be filed pursuant to 11 U.S.C.§ 503. Name of Creditor (the person or other entity to whom the debtor owes money or property): Ford Motor Credit Company, LLC Check this box to indicate that this claim Name and address where notices should be sent: amends a previously filed claim. Ford Motor Credit Company, LLC P.O. Box 6275 Court Claim #: Dearborn, MI 48121 (If known) Telephone Number: 1-800-955-8532 Filed on: Name and address where **payment** should be sent (if different from above): Check this box if you are aware that anyone else has Ford Motor Credit Company, LLC filed a proof of claim relating to your claim. Attach copy of statement giving particulars. Dept 55953 P.O. Box 55000 Detroit, MI 48255-0953 Check this box if you are the debtor or trustee in this 1. Amount of Claim as of Date Case Filed: \$25,517.84 5. Amount of Claim Entitled to Priority under 11 U.S.C. §507(a). If any portion of your claim falls in one of the following categories check the box and state If all or part of your claim is secured, complete item 4 below; however, if all of your claim is unsecured, do not the amount. If all or part of your claim is entitled to priority, complete item 5. Specify the priority of the claim. Check this box if claim includes interest or other charges in addition to the principal amount of the claim. Domestic support obligations under 11 U.S.C. Attach itemized statement of interest or charges. §507(a)(1)(A) or (a)(1)(B). Wages, salaries, or commissions (up to 2. Basis for Claim: Car Loan \$11,725\*) earned within 180 days before filings of the bankruptcy petition or cessation of the debtor's business, whichever is earlier - 11 3. Last four digits of any number by which creditor identifies debtor: 0641 U.S.C. §507(a)(4). 3a. Debtor may have scheduled account as: Contributions to an employee benefit plan - 11 U.S.C. §507(a)(5). 4. Secured Claim Check the appropriate box if your claim is secured by a lien on property or a right of setoff and provide the requested Up to \$2,600\* of deposits toward purchase, lease, or rental of property or services for personal, family, or household use - 11 U.S.C. Nature of property or right of setoff: Real Property ✓ Motor Vehicle Other \_\_\_ Describe: VIN #: 1FMFU15568LA04293 §507(a)(7). Value of Property: \$25,517.84 Annual Interest Rate: 4.00%. Taxes or penalties owed to governmental units -11 U.S.C. §507(a)(8). Amount of arrearage and other charges as of time case filed included in secured claim, if any:, Basis for perfection: \*see attached Other - Specify applicable paragraph of 11 U.S.C. §507(a)(\_\_). Amount of Secured Claim: \$25,517.84 Amount Unsecured: \$.00 Creditor Remarks: 910 CLAIM - NO CRAMDOWN PER STATUTE 6. Credits: The amount of all payments on this claim has been credited for the purpose of making this proof of claim. Amount entitled to priority: 7. Documents: Attach redacted copies of any documents that support the claim, such as promissory notes, purchase orders, invoices, itemized statements of running accounts, contracts, judgments, mortgages, and security agreements. You may also attach a summary. Attach redacted copies of documents providing evidence of perfection of a security interest. You may also attach a summary. (See instruction 7 and definition of "redacted" on \* Amounts are subject to adjustment on 4/1/13 and every 3 years thereafter with respect to cases DO NOT SEND ORIGINAL DOCUMENTS. ATTACHED DOCUMENTS MAY BE DESTROYED AFTER SCANNING. commenced on or after the date of adjustment. If the documents are not available, please explain: FOR COURT USE ONLY Signature: The person filing this claim must sign it. Sign and print name and title, if any, of the creditor or other person Date: May 16, 2011 authorized to file this claim and state address and telephone number if different from the notice address above. Attach copy of power of attorney, if any: /s/ < S. Aruna>

Penalty for presenting fraudulent claim: Fine of up to \$500,000 or imprisonment for up to 5 years, or both. 18 U.S.C. §§ 152 and 3571.

SIGNATURE DATE SIGNATURE THE TRANSACTION WHICH IS THE SUBJECT OF THIS CONTRACT  $\Box$  IS OR  $\Box$  ISNOT SUBJECT TO A FEE RECEIVED BY A BROKER FROM THE SELLING MOTOR VEHICLE DEALER. IF APPLICABLE, THE NAME OF THE BROKER IS: Case 4:099 k/3353 To The State Office of the Company of the Compan

Assignee: Branch
Form No. 12 ©2005 Az Auto Dealers Assoc. (Rev. 9/05)

LIABILITY INSURANCE COVERAGE FOR BODILY INJURY AND PROPERTY DAMAGE CAUSED TO OTHERS IS NOT INCLUDED IN THIS CONTRACT, UNLESS DESCRIBED IN ITEM 11 AND AN APPROPRIATE PREMIUM CHARGE IS SHOWN IN ITEM 8(A) ABOVE. SCUNTRACT, UNLESS DESCRIBED IN TERM 11 AND AN APPROPRIATE PREMIUM CHARGE IS SHOWN IN TIEM 8(A) ABOV SELLER IS REGULATED AND COMPEANING THIS CONTRACT MAY BE ADDRESSED TO:

ARIZONA DEPARMENT OF FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS 2910 N. 440. STREET, SUTE 310
PHOENIX, ARIZONA 5018
TELEPHONE, (402) 255-4421
day of JUNE 20

88
By GRACLE FORD MERCLERY 188

\*\*OTHER OWNERS: If a person shown on the certificate of title as an owner of the vehicle does not want to be separately liable to pay this debt, please sign below to give us a security interest in the Vehicle, its proceeds, and physical damage insurance policy and any refunds of insurance premiums.

ORIGINAL

20 00 By GRACLE FORD MERCURY INC. Its BUS MER



48-7200 R10/08 www.azdot.gov

Vehicle Identification Number

1FMFU15568LA04293

List Price

Year 5008 Make FORD Model

Body Style

4DSW

First Registered 07/2007

029175

Mobile Home Manufacturer

EXT

Unit Number

**FMCC** PO BOX 105704 ATLANTA GA 30348

Title Number

036H00B199009 1

Previous Title Number M060008079018 AZ

State

Issue Date

07172008

Issue Date 03192008 Film Number

I199036H03 Previous Fllm Number

1079M06008

Odometer Miles (no tenths)

0013279 A

\* A - Actual Mileage B - Mileage in excess of the odometer mechanical limits C - NOT Actual Mileage, WARNING ODOMETER DISCREPANCY

Arizona Brands

Previous Brand

State Previous Brand

State Previous Brand

State Other States With Brands

Owners/Lessees

DAVID ALAN CONNELLY

Llenholders

FIRST LIEN-FORD MOTOR CREDIT

PO BOX 105704

LIEN DATE: 06162008 ----

**ATLANTA** 

GA 303485704

Commission Expires

LIEN RELEASE

Lienholder Name Notary Public Signature Acknowledged before me this date.

WATERMARK OR IF ALTERED OR ERASED